

Private Tuition Academies and the Development of Students' Creative and Critical Skills: Perspectives of Academy Managers

UROOJ AZMAT

MPhil Scholar, Department of Education,
University of Management and Technology, Lahore-Pakistan.
Email: uroojazmat1416@gmail.com

Dr. YAAR MUHAMMAD

Assistant Professor, Department of Education,
University of Management and Technology, Lahore-Pakistan.
Email: Yaar.Muhammad@umt.edu.pk

MUHAMMAD JAMIL

PhD Scholar, Department of Education,
University of Management and Technology, Lahore-Pakistan.
Email: jameelphd@gmail.com

Abstract

Private tuition means the extra coaching that is provided outside the regular institutions. This study explores how managers of tuition academies describe the effectiveness of private tuition academies for students' creative and critical learning. In this study, the semi-structured interview design was chosen, and a purposive sampling technique was employed to recruit 13 participants. A semi-structured interview guide was designed and improved after expert opinion. Managers of tuition academies highlighted that private tuition academy had a strong and positive effect on students' achievement. They argued that the education system is examination-oriented; therefore, they provided notes and guess papers to students and more focused on drill learning, thus becoming helpful in achieving higher marks in the examination rather than focusing on students' creative and critical learning. This has some implications for the education system in Pakistan because this can attract students and parents who are after good grades. However, extra coaching methods used in academies may inhibit students' creative and critical skills.

Keywords: *Effectiveness, Tuition Academy, Students' Learning, Perspectives, Creative and Critical Skills.*

Introduction

The present study is conducted to understand the widely spread private tutoring phenomenon. It is intriguing why so many students are interested in joining private tutoring, whereas they also take formal schooling. More specifically, this study explores perceptions of academy managers on the extent of private tuition impact on attainment of students; explores perceptions of academy managers on the extent of the impact of private tuition on the students' creative and critical thinking skills and also explores pedagogic techniques academy managers believe to be necessary for achieving these learning gains. The terms private tutoring and private tuition will be used interchangeably.

Several experts define the process of private tuition in different ways, and it varies from country to country. Hossain (2019) defined tutoring as remedial instruction provided by a person or tutors (instructors or subject specialist who taught the pupils) who is more knowledgeable or expert than the tutees (the persons

who take remedial instruction) at the end of the formal school, during vacations or at the weekend and the tutor or instructor set a fee for teaching the academic subjects. Furthermore, private tutors enable their students to solve difficult problems after private tutoring, which they are unable to learn in mainstream school, and weak students learn subjects under the guidance of private tutors (Hossain, 2019). This process provides help to students at home in the form of homework and academic learning. Tutoring is done sometimes by parents, relatives, or other family members, and sometimes the students find external support, which is provided free of cost and sometimes in the form of payment from the tutees (Manzoor, 2013). A similar definition is used for private tutoring, such as:

Coaching or tuition means the extra help that can be gained by students from any expert and subject specialist to overcome issues and problems to get a good understanding of the subject contents to achieve good marks and grades in examination. This help may be paid, or non-paid depends on the condition and situation concern with the students, their tutors, and centers (Sahito, Khawaja, Siddiqui, Shaheen, & Saeed, 2017, p. 90).

Sometimes private supplementary tutoring is called private tuition or private tutoring, in which tutors provide instruction of course or subject out of the regular or formal school to gain extra salary (Kinyaduka, 2014). Therefore, the private tutoring phenomenon is also referred to as “supplementary teaching,” which is provided by a tutor outside the formal school. It is also provided by the tutors for improving the academic learning of students, for extra/remedial help for weak students, or for financial gain when the government teacher has a low income in mainstream schools. This private tuition takes place at home or any private institution in the form of a small group or one-to-one basis, and there is no restriction about a specific time and class session in the year. Sometimes, it is expected from the family members who have the knowledge and skills to assist students in the home when they have not in a financial condition to arrange private tutors or join private tuition centers.

Private tutoring is not a new term in Pakistan and other developing or developed countries (Tabassum, Afzal, & Taherani, 2015). Private tutoring is a widespread phenomenon all over the world. In 2019, the education minister of Punjab, Murad Raas, barred government school teachers from providing private tuition. In case of violation, the teachers would have to face action under the Punjab Employees Efficiency, Discipline, and Accountability Act (PEEDA) 2006 (Pakistan-today, 2019). Instead of this, nature, form, and demand for private tuition academies have emerged rapidly.

In this era, creative and critical thinking skills are essential for children (Jamil & Muhammad, 2019; Jamil, Muhammad, Masood, & Habib, 2020; Naseer, Muhammad, & Masood, 2020), but it is a common assumption that private tutors are more focused-on drill learning because they have limited time for coverage of syllabus. In formal schools, the class size is a constraint that teachers are unable to pay individual attention to the students (Saleem, Muhammad, & Masood, 2019a, 2019b, 2020a, 2020b). As a result, students join private tuition academies alongside formal schooling.

Research Questions

The purpose of the study is to explore the perspectives of academy managers on the effectiveness of private tuition academies for secondary school students’ learning, especially creative and critical thinking skills. This study addressed the following research objectives:

- To explore the perceptions of academy managers on the extent of the impact of private tuition on the educational attainment of students.
- To explore the perceptions of academy managers on the extent of the impact of private tuition students’ creative and critical thinking skills.
- To explore academy managers’ beliefs regarding pedagogic techniques to be essential for achieving these learning gains.

It is important for policymakers, teachers, parents, and other educational researchers of Pakistan to give specific attention to these specific questions. Very few studies were carried out in Pakistan about the private tutoring phenomenon (e.g., Urooj, 2012; Khan & Shaikh, 2013; Tabassum et al., 2015; Aslam, Khalid, & Shah, 2017; Zubair, Ahmad, & Malik, 2019; Malik, Anwer, & Liu, 2020). However, none of these studies explores how managers of tuition academies describe the effectiveness of private tuition academies for students' creative and critical learning. It is crucial to understand the effect of private tutoring on students learning because extra coaching hours and methods used in academies may inhibit students' creative and critical skills, thus, damaging the bases of economic development in Pakistan. This study was undertaken in light of the perspective of academy management on how they frame the effectiveness of private tuition academies for students' learning.

Methods

Since the study aims to explore the perspectives of academy managers on the effectiveness of private tuition academies for students' learning, qualitative research deemed to be the best-suited approach for this study. Qualitative research is a complex process of interpreting the perspectives and opinions of people to acquire a deep understanding of the multiple realities within human minds, which differ depending on their cultural backgrounds (Creswell & Poth, 2018).

The researchers selected the semi-structured interview design (Brinkmann & Kvale, 2018) from among several choices that fit into the research topic. We used the most appropriate research design that can help in understanding the effectiveness of private tuition academies for students' learning, and the semi-structured interview design was deemed appropriate for the purpose.

Sampling, participants, and research sites

The researcher selected the participants through a purposive sampling technique for this study. It is a non-probability sampling technique that depends on the judgment of the researcher in the selection of participants (Denieffe, 2020; Campbell et al., 2020). Purposive sampling is mainly used for qualitative research (Berndt, 2020). Etikan, Musa, and Alkassim (2016) stated, "for purposive sampling, a researcher has something in mind and participants that suit the purpose of the study are included...the idea behind purposive sampling is to concentrate on people with particular characteristics who will better be able to assist with the relevant research" (p. 1). All the academy managers managing their academies in the geographical area of Mustafa Abad, Kasur constituted the population. They all were invited to participate in this study. For this purpose, the first author (UA) personally visited all the academies in the selected area and introduced the academy managers to the purpose and procedures of the research study.

Moreover, qualitative researchers mostly select a small sample size because they are going to study the concepts in detail that requires much time, and its complexity increases by increasing the sample size (Patton, 2015). Therefore, a small sample size makes the research economical and researchable within limited resources and time. Thirteen private tuition academy managers residing and working in Mustafa Abad, Kasur, who voluntarily consented to be interviewed, were selected for this study. This research included participants who were tutors and running their own private tuition centers.

Data Collection Methods

The data collection method used in this study was semi-structured interviews. In semi-structured interviews, some questions are structured already, but some questions are asked on the spot as a probing or for attaining more detail about the phenomena (Merriam, 2002; Merriam & Tisdell, 2016).

The researcher used criteria to decide whether a participant was eligible to take part in this research (Patton, 2015). It was ensured that a participant was a manager of a private tuition academy; a self-proclaimed

private tutor; and a resident in Mustafa Abad, Kasur. In addition, he or she voluntarily consented to be interviewed, along with agreeing to respond to the follow-up interview.

Before data collection, the first researcher (UA) contacted the managers of private academies through telephonic calls to invite them to take part in the study. In the telephonic conversation, the researcher mentioned the purpose of the study, the participants were briefly informed of the procedure used for the data collection method, and the specification related to the study were shared. Participants had a choice to leave the study at any time without any adverse outcome on their part. After this, the participants were inquired to choose a suitable time and location where the interview would take place.

Semi-structured interviews were conducted with each of the thirteen participants by the first author (UA). The instrument was an interview guide based on the literature review themes (Kvale & Brinkmann, 2015). Semi-structured interviews are partially structured in which some questions are asked from the interview guide while some are asked from the participants on the spot. The interview contained a general to a specific pattern. The interview started with demographic questions related to their age, experience, qualification, etc. Initially, questions were aimed at seeking to identify how the academy managers define characteristics of an effective tutor. Then questions turned to how tutors developed different steps for slow learners and the impact of drill learning on students' creative and critical skills. At first, the researcher asked non-threatening and straightforward questions to build rapport. Gradually, the research moved from important questions to sensitive questions and then to validating questions (Kvale & Brinkmann, 2015). Further, the researcher allowed the participants to share their incidents. The researcher asked probing questions to reach the depth of the topic, but not consistently, which may irritate the participants. Some semi-structured interviews continued for one hour, and a few continued for half an hour. Furthermore, the audio-recordings were used with the permission of the participants (Edwards & Holland, 2013; Fetterman, 2019).

Data Analysis Methods

In this study, the open and pattern coding (Miles, Huberman, & Saldaña, 2020) was used by the first researcher for interview data analysis. After data collection, the essential step within interview research is data analysis that is used by the first researcher to generate themes in the interview data. In most semi-structured interview research designs, coding is used in which data passes through various steps to generate meaningful knowledge (Brinkmann & Kvale, 2018; Miles et al., 2020). After transcribing the interview data, the researcher read the data more than one time for a better understanding (Saldaña, 2021). The first researcher engaged with data by reading and re-reading the transcribed data and by listening to the audio recording and taking essential notes. Several codes for the essential features of the data related to the research questions and literature review were generated (Saldaña, 2021). All the relevant data items were put into codes, and irrelevant material was deleted. All similar codes were clustered to create categories by reorganizing "one long list of codes" generated from the coding of all transcripts into "several lists of categories with related codes as subsets of the categories." (De Gagne & Walters, 2010, p. 138). Themes conveying and compelling, meaningful, and coherent patterns in data were also generated. Coding and theme generation was discussed and verified in a meeting of all authors (Saldaña & Omasta, 2021).

Ensuring Trustworthiness

Several strategies were used to ensure the trustworthiness of the research study. According to Creswell (2007), comparing data of different participants is a crucial technique in ensuring the trustworthiness of data when the study provides a picture of similarities in participants' views and results in rising validity. The accuracy and credibility of the study were increased through member checking, peer debriefing, support, and an audit trail (Creswell & Poth, 2018). The researcher tried to keep biasness aside while writing research and reporting responses. The credibility of the findings was checked by member checking. This technique was used by sending a copy of the study to each participant to check whether the interpretations were accurate. Very few participants adjusted their statements and clarified their intent.

Their suggestions were incorporated in the final report. Audit-trail was implemented by carefully documenting each phase of data collection and analysis. In addition, an external check was ensured by inviting an expert who was familiar with how private tuition academies operate in Pakistan and the nature and type of pedagogical practices employed in them for secondary students to review the documentation of all phases of the study.

Ensuring Ethical Practices

Researchers followed a set of guidelines known as ethical standards while conducting research. It is an obligation of a researcher to act according to ethical standards to avoid potential risks (Tracy, 2020). The participants were protected from the potential harms, which include pain, emotional arousal, and the social stress that may be experienced by interviews and the dissemination of findings (Creswell & Poth, 2018). The researcher informed the details about the research and that participation was voluntary. Before collecting the data, the researcher provided the participants with the informed consent forms, which included an accurate explanation of the methods to be used, the risks, and the benefits (Ryen, 2021). Moreover, the participants were allowed to quit at any time. Participant's personal information and identity, even the organization's name, were kept confidential. The responses of the participants were kept anonymous and fictional names are used instead of the real name. Furthermore, the tape recordings and interview transcripts were kept in a safe location.

Analysis

Small classes, fulfillment of individual needs, proper test sessions, and enhanced parent-teacher interaction

During the interview process, the academy managers were asked to provide a description of private tuition academies' benefits. They were asked to describe whether and how academies benefit the students achieve with the practices of private tutoring sessions in which cannot be achieved in schools. Most participants reported that formal schools have a more qualified teacher, but due to large class sizes, they do not give proper time or individual attention to the students. Some participants stated that the private academies run due to students' money, so for maintaining their academy's standard, the teacher focus on students' individual needs, and teachers do their best in the academy to address these needs. For example, two participants stated,

In a government school, the main problem is students' strength, but we give the benefit that a class has an average number of students; thus, students learn better. If in school 70 to 80 students are in a class, then it is difficult for a teacher to handle them as compared to the academy. We give more focus on students. (Participant-9).

Our students achieve high marks. This is not possible without tutoring. In our schools, the number of students is more than 80, so a teacher does not focus individually on students. But in our academy, this strength is less, so we give proper time. (Participant-13).

Some participants commented that the benefit of private tutoring is in test sessions. They described that in academies, proper test sessions are arranged, and tutors also provide proper feedback by correcting their mistakes. They stated that in schools, the teachers also give the test, but they follow the high authority orders, and they take the test in the mid and at the end of the year only. They stated that in academies, the parent-teacher interaction is developed more, and the test results are frequently reported to the students' parents. For example, a participant stated, "In our academy, we give a test on a daily basis, and some students join academies only for test sessions" (Participant-7). Another participant linked frequent testing with hefty fees and parental involvement: "In our academy, we give the test and invite parents, but it is not

possible in schools. Here we are in more contact with parents because they pay a hefty fee” (Participant-9). In addition, another participant stated,

We are independent. We develop our own framework according to the students’ level and arrange our own tests. These test sessions consist of 10 to 15 tests per subject and so on. But in schools, the teachers do not return the test after marking it. If they return, they do not explain or correct their mistakes. Students keep on making the same mistakes again and again. In school, they will not provide you feedback. (Participant-1)

The development of creative and critical skills in students

This section presents the finding of interviews conducted to understand the perceptions of academy managers about the impact of private tutoring on students’ creative and critical skills. Most academy managers believed that academy tutors develop creative and critical skills in students, and for this, they used different strategies for developing creative and critical skills. In addition, they motivated students to think. They argued that students were unable to attempt their exam papers if they had not developed their thinking skills. Some participants suggested that they developed students’ confidence about the topic and encouraged them to read different books or newspapers to develop creative and critical skills. The participants stated that the basic purpose of tutoring is helping students attain good grades; therefore, they focused upon conceptual learning so that students could attempt papers even after the statement of the question is changed. For example, a participant claimed, “Yes. Obviously, the main purpose of our teaching is to develop creativity among students. We develop an ability to think, understand and apply it to solve academic problems (Participant-2). Another participant claimed, “Yes, we focus on the development of creativity in students. We provide conceptual learning. In exam papers, because of conceptual learning, students attempt questions even when the statement of the question is changed (Participant-9). Another participant claimed,

Yes! Without these, students cannot attempt exam questions in a better way. Some of the questions in the exams are asked from the syllabus, but they change the wording of the questions. So, for this, they need a little creativity. (Participant-4)

Some participants stated that the development of creative and critical skills in students is done in mainstream schools rather than in private tuition. A participant commented, “Our students want to gain maximum marks. We teach in private schools, but we do hard work here. We work hard here not for creativity but for gaining good marks we are responsible for their marks, not for creative and critical skills” (Participant-11). Another participant reported, “To somehow but not to a great extent because we don’t have extra time and we have a lot of syllabi to cover in limited time” (Participant-12).

Effective pedagogies for promoting creative and critical skills

Most participants reported that for the development of creative and critical skills in students, a teacher develops the students’ interest in the lesson, and then according to their interest, customizes the lessons. The participants stated that if students have no interest in the topic, then they never give proper attention to the lesson, and for developing interest, tutors provide information through activities or practical methods. For example, a participant stated, “I think for developing creative skills among students you involve the students in activities, and the second thing is you provide information about the topic then ask students to do practical works on this topic” (Participant-10). Another participant illustrated it,

For developing creative and critical skills, a teacher should create interest in the lesson, and if he creates interest, then students understand this, and then students run on the way to creativity. Otherwise, if he does not understand the lesson in class, then at home, he uses rote learning. The teacher’s task is to make them understand the concepts. The teacher involves students through different activities, exercises, group projects, etc. (Participant-8)

Some participants stated that tutors develop the reading habit in students, and as a result, students' knowledge increases about the topic, and then they can apply this knowledge in a creative way. For example, two participants stated,

If a teacher wants their students to do self-writing, then their interests should be developed in reading books. When students study more things, their knowledge will be increased. We motivate students to apply this knowledge, and then students run on the way to where they become creators. (Participant-1)

Drill-and-practice method—an obstacle to the development of thinking skills

However, most private academy managers reported the use of the drill and practice method in academies as a hindrance to the development of creative and critical thinking skills among students. Participants provided a variety of reasons for generally using the drill and practice method in academies. They perceived that the education system demanded drill learning. Participants noted that the students' main concern was to get marks only. For example, three participants elaborated the factors which pushed them to use the drill and practice method:

The education system pushes us. If we don't follow this, then the students do not get good marks, and if they do not achieve good marks, then our academies will flop. So, you do such things in which your students get more benefits. So, drill learning becomes our need. (Participant-1)

Yes! Obviously, it is true. Academies force children to memorization to get good marks. There are different reasons behind this. For example, I did my MA in English, but in the academy, I have to teach biology. How can I teach bio? I studied arts subjects throughout. What I do, I say to them to rote-learn these short questions, and I do not explain the content...In our education system, there are some lacks. The same questions are repeated in the paper again and again. These students are successful in the exams because of rote learning. (Participant-3)

Parents demand that their child passes the exam at any cost. Some selected questions are given to students to memorize through the drill and practice method so that they get passing marks. But if we say through these methods, students get a higher score, it's not possible because the drill and practice method is needed for below-average students. (Participant-7)

Board results are the main reason behind this. In our exam paper, the questions measure only students' ability of 'Ratta (rote memorization),' not concepts. Our board examiners check the same book wordings to be written in answer sheets. The aim of any academy is then to get good board results. (Participant-11)

There was only one participant who claimed that he discouraged drill-learning in their teaching, believing that we achieve only short-term objectives and creative and critical thinking development becomes impossible. He stated,

Yes! It's true because we want only marks and run after the marks. We have developed a system of marks in our country. But I discourage it throughout my teaching career. Students start rote-memorizing at an early age, but when they go into higher classes, they fail as creative and critical thinking are required there. 'Ratta' has short-range outcomes. When your concepts are clear, it is long-lasting learning. (Participant-8)

Guess papers—another obstacle to the development of thinking skills

During the interview process, the academy managers were asked to provide a description of whether and how they provide guess papers or notes to the students. The finding of the interview data suggested that most of the participants provided notes and guess papers. They prepared notes according to the students'

mental level and considering past papers. Some participants reported that since the curriculum was outdated and some questions were repeated in the board exams every year, covering only selected questions rather than the whole syllabus. They emphasized that the main focus of academies is on getting marks and not on creative and critical thinking. For example, a participant stated, “Yes! Because mostly guess papers are prepared after consulting the past papers, questions that are asked again and again and those questions that are given after the textbook chapters” (Participant-1). Two more participants elaborated it further:

I provide notes for students and individually look at the problem of students. We sort out relevant things in notes. Notes mean to-the-point things, leaving the extra thing. We prepare notes from past papers...No new thing is asked in the board exam; the same things are repeated in the paper. (Participant-4)

Our syllabus is 20 years old, and the same questions are repeated again and again in the exam. So, the main focus we give to these questions. In academies, we create facilities for children that those questions repeated again and again in the examination, then we give more attention to these important questions. These types of questions are prepared for every subject. After rote-memorizing these questions, students can get good marks. (Participant-5)

Furthermore, the participants stated that our students demand notes because they do not have the habit of book reading, and they search for shortcuts for getting passing marks:

Students demand notes because today, students join the academy for entertainment. Students want some easy way, so they demand notes. It is a weakness or demerit of our syllabus that it is outdated. (Participant-5)

I provide them notes or guess paper because it has become our students' need because they seek a shortcut way to succeed in the exam. (Participant-13)

Few participants reported that they did not provide any notes or guess papers because they want to develop students' higher-order thinking, but they provided notes to the students who wanted only 33% of marks or had low abilities. The participants said that when students were provided notes, they could not develop effective reading habits, necessary for developing thinking skills among students. A participant was of the view, “Our new generation is academically weak... Our students seek ‘shortcuts’ nowadays” (Participant-3), and he reported, “No. I am not providing any notes. Some students who want only 33% marks demand notes, but I discourage it (Participant-3). In addition, a participant had a different strategy to handle this:

No. I recommend books only. A good teacher always recommends books. We do not recommend any key books. When we recommend notes, the potential of reading books is lost. But unfortunately, in our academy, notes are provided to those students who have low ability and for those who want a shortcut. (Participant-6)

Discussion

In order to examine the impact of private tutoring on students' creative and critical skills, the participants were asked questions related to how they developed creative thinking along with the drill and practice method, why they assumed drill learning was necessary for private tuition academies, and what reasons they provided for the provision of note papers.

Creative and critical skills are considered most important for students to become good citizens (Jamil et al., 2020). Most students join academies, which has become the third emerging sector (Chuahry & Javed, 2012); therefore, this research study analyses whether tutors develop creative or critical skills in students during private tutoring and identified how and why the tutors developed these skills. Most participants

claimed that they aimed to develop creative and critical skills in students through different strategies. They believed that they developed students' interest and motivated them for learning, and if students did not take an interest in the lesson, then they taught them through practical methods. They also reported their belief that creative and critical skills could be developed through quiz competition and book reading.

The participants provided the reason for developing creative and critical skills in students because they considered that these skills are vital for getting good grades, and students could not attempt exam papers without these skills because sometimes the statements were changed in the exam. If students did not have creative skills, they were unable to attempt the paper and solve questions correctly. However, some participants claimed that due to limited time, the development of creative and critical skills in students is not done in private tuition academies.

It has become a common assumption that private academies are more focused on drill learning (Yung, 2020). The interview data confirmed it and provided details about the reasons why private tutors are more focused on the drill and practice method. The participants commented that due to the examination system, drill learning rises because the primary concern of the students and their parents had become the attainment of good marks rather than their creative and critical skills. Yung (2020) considers private tutoring "as a form of oppression which reinforces the existing oppression in the current context of high-stakes testing under neoliberalism" (p. 125). It is also evident from the data that when the less qualified and inexperienced teacher provided instruction, his or her focus was more on drill learning. The participants claimed that the reason for drill learning was that the same questions were repeated in the papers again and again, so tutors were more focused on those questions rather than covering the whole syllabus. But few participants reported that they discouraged drill and rote learning because they considered that through drill learning, they achieved only short-range goals rather than long-range goals such as creative and critical thinking skills among students.

Provision of notes and guess papers has become a trend in private academies. The participants provided various reasons for providing notes: The notes were prepared from the selected syllabus according to the students' mental abilities after considering past papers, which were helpful for the students to achieve passing marks. The participants mentioned that students did not have a habit of reading books, and they sought shortcuts for receiving passing marks. The participants underscored that they wanted to develop creative and critical skills in their students and that the main reason for developing these skills was to enable their students to achieve excellent marks in the board exams, not for developing their creative and critical thinking skills among students.

It is obvious from the above findings that the academy managers have various reasons for providing notes and guess papers to the students attending their academies. The state examination system promotes the demand for notes and guess-papers because the same low-order-thinking questions are repeated every year. There is a need to change the existing examination system, and higher-order-thinking questions should be asked in the questions papers (Muhammad, 2015). This may push academies to develop students creative and critical skills. However, camming notes and guess paper material is detrimental to the students' ability and allows a high degree of 'surface learning' (Biggs & Tang, 2011). Thus, this practice of academy managers may hinder students' creative and critical skills.

Conclusion

Managers of tuition academies highlighted that private tuition academies had a strong and positive effect on students' achievement, which they believed could contribute to the economic enhancement and prosperity of the country. They argued that they mostly used the lecture method because of the coverage of the syllabus in a limited time. Furthermore, they argued that the education system is examination-oriented; therefore, they provided notes and guess papers to students and more focused on drill learning, thus becoming helpful in achieving higher marks in the examination rather than focusing on creative and critical

thinking skills. This has some implications for the education system in Pakistan because this can attract students and parents who are after good grades. However, extra coaching methods used in academies may inhibit students' creative and critical skills, thus damaging one of the bases of economic development in Pakistan.

Recommendations for Policy and Practice

This study provided a small window into academy managers' perceptions exploring how managers of private academies describe: impact of private tuition on the attainment of students, especially in the development of critical and creative skills among students and explore pedagogic techniques academy managers believe to be essential for achieving learning gains.

The examination system of Pakistani institutions should be reformed, and it should measure students' thinking ability rather than memorization.

The government should regulate and monitor private tuition, so it helps to seek the best practices for both private tuition and mainstream schools.

The teacher should provide conceptual based learning to the students for the development of critical and creative skills among students in schools as well as in tuition academies. The mainstream institutions, as well as tuition academies should ensure teachers are well versed in the latest teaching methodologies for the development of critical and creative skills among students in schools. In addition, teachers should be appointed according to the student's strength. In addition, workshops or training programs for in-service teachers may be arranged so that teachers can have updated knowledge and teaching skills for the development of critical and creative skills and most importantly, they have a positive attitude towards these educational goals.

Suggestions for Future Studies

Following few studies are suggested to be conducted by future researchers:

In this study, the data were collected from the academy managers only. It suggested a future study may collect data from the other stakeholders like parents, students, and teachers in order to develop a more holistic picture of this phenomenon.

Interviews were the method of data collection in the current study. It is suggested that in future studies, participants should also be observed alongside interviews. The practice of tutors and students' performance should be observed for getting in-depth information in order to produce more reliable and trustworthy claims about the perceptions and practices of the academy managers and tutors.

This study interviewed only 13 participants of Mustafa Abad, Kasur, who were chosen through the purposive sampling technique. Therefore, the results of the study are not generalizable to a larger population. Therefore, it is recommended that a survey research study should be conducted with a larger sample.

The present study is a reflection of the perceptions of academy managers of Mustafa Abad Kasur. The geographical context may have influenced academy managers. Therefore, it is recommended to explore this issue by conducting this study in a different geographical context.

References

- Aslam, A., Khalid, S., & Shah, Z. A. (2017). Bringing shadow education into light: Exploring reasons for expansion. *Journal of Education and Research (JER)*, 13(1), 28-44.
- Berndt, A. E. (2020). Sampling methods. *Journal of Human Lactation*, 36(2), 224-226. Retrieved from <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/0890334420906850>. doi:10.1177/0890334420906850
- Biggs, J., & Tang, C. (2011). *Teaching for quality learning at university* (4th ed.). Berkshire: Open University Press.
- Brinkmann, S., & Kvale, S. (2018). *Doing interviews* (2nd ed.). London: Sage.
- Campbell, S., Greenwood, M., Prior, S., Shearer, T., Walkem, K., Young, S., . . . Walker, K. (2020). Purposive sampling: complex or simple? Research case examples. *Journal of Research in Nursing*, 0(0), 1-10. Retrieved from <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/1744987120927206>. doi:10.1177/1744987120927206
- Chudhry, W., & Javed, F. (2012). History and culture of tuition academies: voicing native's perspective. *Asian Journal of Management Sciences and Education*, 1(3), 101-110.
- Creswell, J. W. (2007). *Five qualitative approaches to inquiry* (2 ed.). New Delhi Sage Publications.
- Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry & research design: Choosing among five approaches* (4th ed.). Los Angeles: Sage.
- De Gagne, J. C., & Walters, K. J. (2010). The lived experience of online educators: Hermeneutic phenomenology. *Journal of Online Learning and Teaching*, 6(2), 357-366.
- Denieffe, S. (2020). Commentary: Purposive sampling: complex or simple? Research case examples. *Journal of Research in Nursing*, 0(0), 1-2. Retrieved from <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/1744987120928156>. doi:10.1177/1744987120928156
- Edwards, R., & Holland, J. (2013). *What is qualitative interviewing?* : A&C Black.
- Etikan, I., Musa, S. A., & Alkassim, R. S. (2016). Comparison of convenience sampling and purposive sampling. *American journal of theoretical and applied statistics*, 5(1), 1-4.
- Fetterman, D. M. (2019). *Ethnography: Step-by-step* (4th ed.). London: Sage.
- Hossain, A. (2019). Influence of private tutoring on the SSC level learners: A case study of Gazipur District. *Anglisticum: Journal of the Association-Institute for English Language and American Studies*, 7. doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.0001/tjllis.v7i0.1833>
- Jamil, M., & Muhammad, Y. (2019). Teaching science students to think critically: Understanding secondary school teachers' practices. *Journal of Research and Reflections in Education*, 13(2), 1-11.
- Jamil, M., Muhammad, Y., Masood, S., & Habib, Z. (2020). Critical thinking: A qualitative content analysis of education policy and secondary school science curriculum documents. *Journal of Research and Reflections in Education*, 14(2), 249-258.
- Khan, B. H., & Shaikh, S. A. (2013). Analyzing the market for shadow education in Pakistan: Does private tuition affect the learning gap between private and public schools? *Lahore Journal of Economics*, 18(SE), 129-160.
- Kinyaduka, B. D. (2014). Private tutoring: A critical analysis of world experiences. *Merit Research Journal of Education and Review*, 2(8), 135-140.
- Kvale, S., & Brinkmann, S. (2015). *Interviews: Learning the craft of qualitative research interviewing* (3rd ed.). London: Sage.
- Malik, M. A., Anwer, M., & Liu, B. (2020). Shadow teaching and actual disparity: A study from the perspectives of grade 9 students in Pakistan. *Journal of Research and Reflections in Education*, 14(1), 39-52.
- Manzoor, S. (2013). *Reasons and necessity of private tutoring in English for Bangla medium primary school students in Bangladesh*. (Unpublished doctoral dissertation), BRAC University, Dhaka, Bangladesh.
- Merriam, S. B. (2002). *Introduction to qualitative research* (1st ed.). New York: Jossey-Bass
- Merriam, S. B., & Tisdell, E. J. (2016). *Qualitative research: A guide to design and implementation* (4th ed.). San Francisco, CA: John Wiley & Sons.
- Miles, M., Huberman, M., & Saldaña, J. (2020). *Qualitative data analysis: A methods sourcebook* (4th ed.).

- New York: Sage Publications.
- Muhammad, Y. (2015). *Pakistani national identity, cultural diversity and global perspective: A policy trajectory study of the national curriculum for secondary school Pakistan Studies in Punjab*. (Unpublished doctoral dissertation), University of Tasmania, Tasmania.
- Naseer, H., Muhammad, Y., & Masood, S. (2020). Critical thinking skills in a secondary school Pakistan studies textbook: A qualitative content analysis. *sjesr*, 3(4), 84-95.
- Pakistan-today. (2019). Govt bars public school teachers from private tutoring. Retrieved from <https://archive.pakistantoday.com.pk/2019/02/20/govt-bars-public-school-teachers-from-private-tutoring/>
- Patton, M. Q. (2015). *Qualitative research & research methods (4th ed.)*. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Ryen, A. (2021). Research ethics: Between care and control. In D. Silverman (Ed.), *Qualitative Research* (pp. 35-45). London: Sage.
- Sahito, Z., Khawaja, M., Siddiqui, A., Shaheen, A., & Saeed, H. (2017). Role of tuition centers in the performance and achievement of students: A case of Hyderabad District, Sindh, Pakistan. *Journal of Education and Training Studies*, 5(4), 90-102.
- Saldaña, J. (2021). *The coding manual for qualitative researchers* (4th ed.). London: SAGE Publications Limited.
- Saldaña, J., & Omasta, M. (2021). *Qualitative research: Analyzing life* (2nd ed.). London: Sage Publications.
- Saleem, A., Muhammad, Y., & Masood, S. (2019a). Negative emotions and self-created challenges of novice public-school teachers in managing classroom behaviour. *Journal of elementary education*, 29(2), 178-195.
- Saleem, A., Muhammad, Y., & Masood, S. (2019b). *Self-created challenges of novice public-school teachers in managing classroom*. Paper presented at the 7 International Conference on Research in Education, Institute of Education and Research, University of the Punjab, Lahore.
- Saleem, A., Muhammad, Y., & Masood, S. (2020a). Classroom management challenges and administrative support in elementary schools: Experiences of novice public-school teachers. *UMT Education Review*, 3(2), 29-46.
- Saleem, A., Muhammad, Y., & Masood, S. (2020b). Support needs of novice public-school teachers for effective management of elementary level classrooms in Lahore. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 4(III), 682-697.
- Tabassum, N., Afzal, T., & Taherani, A. (2015). Impact of private tuition centers on government educational institutions in district Hyderabad. *New Horizons*, 9(1), 113 – 125.
- Tracy, S. J. (2020). *Qualitative research methods: Collecting evidence, crafting analysis, communicating impact* (2nd ed.). Hoboken, NJ: Wiley-Blackwell,.
- Urooj, S. (2012). The growing culture of tuition centres at secondary level of education in Pakistan: An exploratory study. *Interdisciplinary Journal of Contemporary Research In Business*, 4(6), 1119-1125.
- Yung, K. W.-H. (2020). Shadow education as a form of oppression: Conceptualizing experiences and reflections of secondary students in Hong Kong. *Asia Pacific Journal of Education*, 41(1), 115–129. doi:<https://doi.org/10.1080/02188791.2020.1727855>
- Zubair, H. B., Ahmad, I., & Malik, I. H. (2019). Exploring the contemporary educational challenges and impact of influential coaching classes of English language learning in Pakistan. *Orient Research Journal of Social Sciences*, 4(1), 31-44.